

## COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF STUDENT SATISFACTION WITH READING, DISCUSSION, AND DEMONSTRATION TEACHING METHODS IN HEALTH ASSESSMENT AMONG UNDERGRADUATE NURSING STUDENTS

Saima Ashiq<sup>1</sup>, Fatima Rasheed<sup>2</sup>, Misbah Uddin<sup>3</sup>, Dr. Shah Hussain<sup>4</sup>, Zainab<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>MSN, College of Nursing. AFGMI. NUMS

<sup>2</sup>PRN, BSN, Nursing Officer, DHQ Khanewal

<sup>3</sup>BSN, MPH School of Nursing and Public Health Manchester metropolitan university Manchester.

<sup>4</sup>PhD\*, MSN, Principal, Assistant Professor, Janbar College of Nursing & Allied Health Sciences, Swat.

<sup>5</sup>MS Nursing scholar, Institute of Nursing Sciences, Khyber Medical University, Peshawar, Pakistan.

<sup>1</sup>saimumarimran@gmail.com, <sup>2</sup>fahadali5759@gmail.com, <sup>3</sup>umisbah610@gmail.com, <sup>4</sup>shahpicu@gmail.com

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.17365370>

### Keywords

Nursing education, teaching methods, student satisfaction, demonstration, discussion, reading

### Article History

Received: 26 August 2025

Accepted: 04 October 2025

Published: 16 October 2025

Copyright @Author

Corresponding Author: \*

Dr. Shah Hussain

### Abstract

Teaching methods play a critical role in shaping students' learning experiences and overall satisfaction in nursing education. Identifying which instructional strategies are most effective is essential for enhancing student engagement and academic performance. The study aimed to assess the satisfaction level of undergraduate nursing students with three teaching methods—reading, discussion, and demonstration in the subject of Health Assessment. An analytical cross-sectional study was conducted among 286 undergraduate nursing students from nursing colleges in Swat. A structured questionnaire was used to collect demographic data and students' satisfaction scores regarding the three teaching methods. Descriptive statistics, ANOVA, and chi-square tests were applied for analysis. The sample consisted mainly of male students (67.8%) and those aged 21–23 years (48.6%). Most participants were from the 2nd year of study (53.8%). Among teaching methods, demonstration received the highest satisfaction mean score ( $4.26 \pm 0.73$ ), followed by discussion ( $3.78 \pm 0.91$ ) and reading ( $3.12 \pm 0.84$ ). ANOVA results revealed a significant difference in satisfaction across methods ( $F = 19.65, p < 0.001$ ). However, chi-square tests indicated no significant association between satisfaction levels and demographic variables such as gender ( $p = 0.24$ ) and age group ( $p = 0.45$ ). The findings highlight that demonstration is the most preferred and effective teaching method among nursing students, emphasizing the importance of interactive and practical strategies in nursing education. Institutions should focus on incorporating more demonstration and discussion-based learning to enhance student satisfaction and academic outcomes.

### INTRODUCTION

Student satisfaction is a general assessment of the academic experiences of the learners and is the major factor in the determination of the quality of

education. Instructional strategies refer to methods that are applied in imparting knowledge and skills to students [1]. The reading approach entails self-guided

reading and interpretation of written information. Discussion technique places more focus on interactive dialogue, critical thinking and sharing ideas through peers [2]. Demonstration method is a teaching method that is visual and practical in which the teacher demonstrates a procedure or a skill to the students so they can observe and practice the procedure. Health assessment is a core nursing topic that equips students with the skills on how to gather, interpret, and analyze patient data in order to make clinical decisions [3].

The literatures indicate that the levels of dissatisfaction with conventional lecture-based learning in nursing education are between 35 to 55 % all over the world. It has been recognized that interactive delivery in the form of discussion and demonstration usually favors the student since it is correlated with increased engagement and performance results [4]. In South Asian nations, almost half of undergraduate nursing students indicate that they lacked confidence with clinical skills following health assessment courses, implying that there is a disconnect between teaching systems and learning outcomes [5]. Traditional reading and lecture methods of nursing education are still prevalent in Pakistan, and they might not be in line with the learning requirements of students [6].

Undergraduate nursing programs incorporate health assessment as one of their pillar courses because it creates the basic skills necessary in taking care of patients. [7]. It also provides the students with skills of physical examination, history taking, and clinical judgment. The pedagogical approach used in this topic will largely determine the level at which students will gain theoretical and practical skills. Second-year nursing students are at a very critical phase of theory-clinical practice, so the role of teaching method is particularly significant [8].

The value of the reading method has always been appreciated in terms of fostering independent learning and understanding. Nonetheless, it is controversial in practice-based courses such as health assessment, in which pragmatic performance and clinical reasoning are vital [9]. Although reading increases knowledge retention, it may not be effective in creating confidence and application. [10]. Students complain of having problems in relation to translating

theoretical readings into actual assessment aspects. [11].

Discussion method offers an interactive environment where learning and questioning, as well as peer learning, are encouraged. It also encourages critical thinking and communication, which is a very crucial aspect in clinical decision-making. [12]. Students of nursing, who were exposed to the use of discussion-based learning, show a better level of conceptual knowledge and problem-solving skills. [13]. Nonetheless, it may be hampered by issues like unequal contribution and reliance on the group dynamics unless it is facilitated well. [14].

It is well known that the demonstration method has a great effectiveness in teaching psychomotor and clinical skills. Perceiving a skill used by an instructor and practicing it gives confidence and competence in health assessment. [15]. Research has revealed that demonstration results in increased performance in objective structured clinical examination (OSCEs) than conventional teaching methods. There is also increased satisfaction with the method as it lessens ambiguity and the connection between theory and practice [16].

The satisfaction levels of students between reading, discussing, and demonstrating can give useful data, which can be used in designing the curriculum in nursing schools. The awareness of the approaches that students consider as the most efficient one can help teachers to implement blended or new strategies that will help to maximize learning results. This kind of evidence is especially critical in Pakistan, where the nursing education is in the transition to the global standards as well as the improvement of clinical competence among graduates.

### Methodology

The study design was analytical cross-sectional study design to determine the satisfaction of undergraduate nursing students with reading, discussion and demonstration teaching methods in the subject of Health Assessment. It was carried out in various nursing colleges in Swat, whereby the total population of second-year undergraduate students in the nursing colleges was 800. A simple random sampling lottery method was used for participant selection.

A total of 800 second-year undergraduate nursing students in the sampled nursing colleges in Swat were

found. The sample size was estimated with the help of Raosoft sample size calculator bearing a 95% confidence level, 5% margin of error and 50 % response distribution. On these parameters, the estimated sample size was 260 participants. The final sample size was changed to 286 participants to counter a 10% non-response or dropout rate. This was a modification which ensured that the study had sufficient statistical power and representation of the target population.

#### Data Collection Procedure

The data were gathered in a pretested structured questionnaire adopted (Reliability C Alpha 0.84 and CVI 0.94), which was designed specifically to measure the student satisfaction with the three teaching methodologies, namely reading, discussion, and demonstration. The questionnaire also incorporated Likert scale questions and closed-ended questions that gave a descriptive and comparative result on the level of satisfaction. Institutional review boards of Zalan College of Nursing, Ref No. ZCN/25/14/IRB gave their ethical approval. Informed consent involving each student was obtained in written form, and informed consent explained the purpose of the study. This would involve voluntary participation, keeping

confidential and assuring the students that no academic consequences would be made against non-participation or withdrawal.

#### Data Analysis Procedure

Data were analyzed using SPSS Version 27. Descriptive statistics, including frequencies, percentages, means, and standard deviations, were calculated to summarize student responses. Inferential statistics, including chi-square tests and one-way ANOVA, were applied to examine associations and differences in satisfaction levels across the three teaching methods. A p-value of <0.05 was considered statistically significant.

#### Results and Analysis

The sample consisted predominantly of males (67.8%), while females made up 32.2%. Most participants were aged 21–23 years (48.6%), followed by 18–20 years (36.7%), and fewer were 24 years or older (14.7%). In terms of study semester, a slightly higher proportion were in the 3<sup>rd</sup> semester (53.8%) compared to the 4<sup>th</sup> semester (46.2%). Overall, the participants represented a young, mostly male population with balanced distribution across study years [Table 1].

Variable	Category	Frequency (n)	Percentage (%)
Gender	Male	194	67.8
	Female	92	32.2
Age (years)	18–20	105	36.7
	21–23	139	48.6
	24 and above	42	14.7
Semester of Study	3 <sup>rd</sup>	154	53.8
	4 <sup>th</sup>	132	46.2

Table 1. Demographic Characteristics of Participants (n = 286)

The results show that among the three teaching methods, demonstration had the highest mean score (4.26 ± 0.73), indicating strong student preference and effectiveness. Discussion followed with a mean of

3.78 ± 0.91, suggesting it was also well-received. Reading had the lowest mean score (3.12 ± 0.84), reflecting comparatively less satisfaction. Overall, students favored practical and interactive methods over passive learning [Table 2].

Teaching Method	Mean ± SD	Minimum	Maximum

Reading	3.12 ± 0.84	1.0	5.0
Discussion	3.78 ± 0.91	1.5	5.0
Demonstration	4.26 ± 0.73	2.0	5.0

Table 2. Mean Satisfaction Scores by Teaching Method

The ANOVA results indicate a statistically significant difference in satisfaction scores across the three teaching methods ( $F = 19.65, p < 0.001$ ). The between-groups variance (58.34) was notably higher than expected by chance, while the within-groups variance

remained lower (421.72). This suggests that teaching method type had a strong influence on students' satisfaction levels, confirming meaningful variation among reading, discussion, and demonstration methods [Table 3].

Source of Variation	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F-value	p-value
Between Groups	58.34	2	29.17	19.65	<0.001*
Within Groups	421.72	283	1.49		
Total	480.06	285			

Table 3. Comparison of Student Satisfaction Across Teaching Methods (One-way ANOVA)

The chi-square analysis shows no significant association between gender and satisfaction level ( $\chi^2 = 2.84, p = 0.24$ ), nor between age group and satisfaction level ( $\chi^2 = 3.65, p = 0.45$ ). Although

females (62.9%) and students aged 21–23 years (64.0%) reported slightly higher satisfaction compared to their counterparts, these differences were not statistically significant. This indicates that satisfaction with teaching methods was consistent across gender and age categories. [Table 4].

Variable	Category	High Satisfaction n (%)	Moderate Satisfaction n (%)	Low Satisfaction n (%)	$\chi^2$	df	p-value
Gender	Male	50 (54.3)	30 (32.6)	12 (13.1)	2.84	2	0.24
	Female	122 (62.9)	58 (29.9)	14 (7.2)			
Age Group	18–20	61 (58.1)	34 (32.4)	10 (9.5)	3.65	4	0.45
	21–23	89 (64.0)	40 (28.8)	10 (7.2)			
	24+	22 (52.4)	14 (33.3)	6 (14.3)			

Table 4. Association Between Demographic Variables and Satisfaction Levels (Chi-square Test)

### Discussion

The current research paper assessed the contentment of the undergraduate nursing students with three teaching strategies, namely, reading, discussion, and demonstration in the course of Health Assessment. Results have shown that demonstration was linked to the greatest level of satisfaction, then discussion and reading was considered the least satisfying activity. These findings demonstrate the significance of active and experiential learning as a strategy in nursing education particularly in courses that demand both theoretical and clinical skill acquisition.

The satisfaction levels with demonstration are also consistent with the findings of studies by Chaabane et al. [15], who established that students would expect demonstration-based methods of learning clinical skills to be more effective than conventional lectures. In the same way [16], underlined that demonstration enhances competence and confidence in practice-based nursing topics, which can be reflective of the current results. However, [17], also observed that demonstration alone can be a constraint to critical thought in favor of a combined method.

The teaching based on discussions also received positive feedback that aligns with the results of [13], who discovered that group discussions could improve group of nursing students through peer learning, problem-solving, and teamwork. [18], also confirmed that discussion is a way of reducing stress, as well as enhancing engagement, which aligns with moderate levels of satisfaction that were identified in this study. Nevertheless, [19], found that discussion-based approaches in large classes were not always successful due to the unequal nature of the participation, which is not explicitly mentioned in the present results.

The slightly lower satisfaction with reading is indicative of a general negative view of passive learning in nursing education. According to [11], students usually find it difficult to transfer theoretical knowledge gained with the help of reading to actual clinical practice. On the same note, [20] found out that the conventional teaching approaches like reading and lectures tend to lead to their disengagement and poor skills development. However, [21] has claimed that reading also has a significant role in the development of basic knowledge and cannot be fully denied, and the author states that

this approach should be complementary and not exclusionary.

It is corroborated by the comparison of these results with international ones and illustrates similarities and contextual differences. [22], reported that experiential and interactive strategies in the world are associated with more satisfaction in health-related education, which explains the superiority of the demonstration and discussion in this study. Conversely, [23], determined that the perception of teaching approaches was affected by the levels of academic stress and that contextual stress factors in Pakistani nursing colleges might also have an impact on the results of satisfaction, which were not directly measured in this study.

The results are relevant to development of a discussion about the best teaching practices in nursing education. Although demonstration and discussion yielded better results, the study provides that blended methods that incorporate reading to obtain basic knowledge, discussion to develop critical thinking, and demonstration to facilitate learning of specific skills could yield the most holistic results. This can be related to the view of [24], who stated that multimodal teaching promotes resilience, self-efficacy, and well-being among nursing students.

In general, the present study coincides with the international evidence in support of student-centered, interactive, and practical teaching approaches to nursing education. The difference between greater satisfaction with the active approach and less satisfaction with passive reading demonstrates the paradigm shift in the sphere of education practice. The future research needs to examine the long-term learning outcomes and analyze how the combination of these methods can potentially affect not only satisfaction but also academic achievement, clinical performance, and professional readiness.

### Conclusion

The research evaluated the contentment of the undergraduate nursing students with the reading, discussion, and demonstration teaching approaches in the subject of Health Assessment. The results showed that demonstration was the most satisfactory method followed by discussion with reading being the least effective approach. These findings emphasize the

importance of active and experiential methods of teaching in improving the learning outcomes of skill-based nursing courses. Demonstration enabled students to relate theoretical information and clinical practice, whereas discussion enabled them to exchange ideas critically and interact with peers. Reading, though the fundamental knowledge was less attractive when it was taken as an initial approach. The findings indicate that student satisfaction has a great impact on the teaching approaches that facilitate interaction, practical application, and confidence building.

### Recommendations

- ✓ Nursing faculty: Teaching of health assessment through demonstration and discussion are the most effective ways of engaging students and making them satisfied.
- ✓ Blended teaching This approach to be applied should be based on the use of reading, discussion, and demonstration as the methods of strengthening the theoretical knowledge and the acquisition of practical skills.
- ✓ Faculty development workshops should be a regular event where teachers are trained on the student-centered interactive pedagogies.
- ✓ Curriculum Nursing curriculums must include structured demonstration with discussion and facilitated reflection to enhance clinical competence.
- ✓ Good resources like skill laboratory, simulation models, and audiovisual aids should also be provided by the institutions to facilitate effective teaching based on demonstration.
- ✓ Future studies ought to focus on the effect of these teaching practices on academic achievement and clinical expertise outcomes besides satisfaction.
- ✓ Further research into the effect of effective pedagogical strategies should be carried out in various subjects and levels of nursing to give a more comprehensive understanding of the topic.

### References

Cant R, Gazula S, Ryan C. Predictors of nursing student satisfaction as a key quality indicator of tertiary students' education experience: An integrative review. *Nurse Education Today*. 2023 Jul 1;126:105806.

- James PC. What Determines Student Satisfaction in an E-Learning Environment? A Comprehensive Literature Review of Key Success Factors. *Higher Education Studies*. 2021;11(3):1-9.
- Adhikari T. Enhancing Quality of Basic Level Education through Demonstration Method. *Triyuga Academic Journal*. 2024 Dec 16;3(1):190-207.
- Zainuddin A. Application of Demonstration and Experiment Methods in Fiqh Learning in Improving Student Psychomotor Skills. *Journal of Education and Learning Innovation*. 2024 Dec 14;1(2):254-64.
- Zhang Q, Tang X, Zhao Y, Wang Z. Team-based learning vs. lecture-based learning in nursing: A systematic review of randomized controlled trials. *Frontiers in public health*. 2023 Jan 4;10:1044014.
- Mohammadnejad S, Heidarzadeh H, Pakseresht M, Vasiee A, Taheri S. Comparison of Problem-Based Learning and Lecture Methods on Teaching and Learning Satisfaction: A Quasi-Experimental Study. *Journal of Basic Research in Medical Sciences: Volume*. 2025 Jan 1;12(1).
- Ma C, Zhou W. Effects of unfolding case-based learning on academic achievement, critical thinking, and self-confidence in undergraduate nursing students learning health assessment skills. *Nurse Education in Practice*. 2022 Mar 1;60:103321.
- Grønlien HK, Christoffersen TE, Ringstad Ø, Andreassen M, Lugo RG. A blended learning teaching strategy strengthens the nursing students' performance and self-reported learning outcome achievement in an anatomy, physiology and biochemistry course—A quasi-experimental study. *Nurse education in practice*. 2021 Mar 1;52:103046.
- Hussain S, Mohammad S, Ullah A, Shah A, Shakoor A, Farooq M. Challenges Faced by Patients After Bariatric Surgery: A Qualitative Study in Swat, KPK, Pakistan. *medtigo*. 2025 Mar 24;3(1).

- Hussain S, Anwar M, Ullah A, Ullah W, Gul H, Khan N. The Effect of Work-Life Balance Programs on Burnout Levels and Professional Performance Among Nurses a Mixed-Method Study at Saidu Teaching Hospital Swat, Pakistan. *medtigo Journal of Medicine*. 2025 Mar 18;3(1).
- Benes S, Alperin H. The essentials of teaching health education: Curriculum, instruction, and assessment. *Human Kinetics*; 2022.
- Mugabekazi JC, Mukanziza J, Nizeyimana P, Manirahari P. Integrating collaborative learning strategies in the curriculum: enhancing critical thinking and communication skills in primary education. *European Journal of Education Studies*. 2025 Feb 28;12(3).
- Jiang JP, Hu JY, Zhang YB, Yin XC. Fostering college students' critical thinking skills through peer assessment in the knowledge building community. *Interactive Learning Environments*. 2023 Dec 15;31(10):6480-96.
- Clerkin R, Patton D, Moore Z, Nugent L, Avsar P, O'Connor T. What is the impact of video as a teaching method on achieving psychomotor skills in nursing? A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Nurse Education Today*. 2022 Apr 1;111:105280.
- Resch K, Schrittmesser I. Using the Service-Learning approach to bridge the gap between theory and practice in teacher education. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*. 2023 Aug 24;27(10):1118-32.
- Bayona JA, Durán WF. A meta-analysis of the influence of case method and lecture teaching on cognitive and affective learning outcomes. *The International Journal of Management Education*. 2024 Mar 1;22(1):100935.
- Oloje M. Demonstration Method And Students' Academic. Available at SSRN 5006366. 2024 Oct 31.
- Oloje M. Demonstration Method And Students' Academic Achievement In Senior Secondary School In Chemistry In Calabar Municipality Cross River State, Nigeria (October 31, 2024). 2024 Oct 31.
- Sebullen M, Bantali J. Working Student Nurses: A Husserlian Phenomenology of Study-Work Balance. *Journal of Interdisciplinary Perspectives*. 2025 Jul 31;3(8):979-85.
- Ciydem E, Avcı D. The Effect of Forgiveness and Resilience on Anxiety, Depression and Stress in Nursing Students. *Journal of Holistic Nursing*. 2025 Mar;43(1):26-37.
- Zenda R. The importance of teaching resources on physical sciences learners' academic achievement in rural schools: A case of South Africa. *Social Education Research*. 2024 Aug 14:407-20.
- Zenda R. The importance of teaching resources on physical sciences learners' academic achievement in rural schools: A case of South Africa. *Social Education Research*. 2024 Aug 14:407-20.
- Mitchell R. Documenting L2 input and interaction during study abroad: Approaches, instruments and challenges. *Second Language Research*. 2023 Jan;39(1):59-83.
- Ricci M, Evangelista A, Di Roma A, Fiorentino M. Immersive and desktop virtual reality in virtual fashion stores: a comparison between shopping experiences. *Virtual Reality*. 2023 Sep;27(3):2281-96